

City of Cleveland

Community Benefit Scorecard







Purpose of Community Benefit Scorecard



Identify community benefits in development projects and inform future community benefits agreements



Provide consistency in the process of applying for development incentives from the City



Communicate the City's development priorities for investment and growth





Community Benefit Scorecard Process

INITIAL MEETING







Scorecard Points Allocation

- Scoring system designed to favor projects that satisfy the greatest number of criteria.
- Scoring categories weighted in favor of preferred criteria.
- Projects' total score on the scorecard will help City determine the recommended amount of financial assistance.
- There are separate scorecard criteria for residential, mixed-use, and commercial/industrial, and neighborhood commercial developments.
- The Scorecard is currently in a testing phase. Ultimately, the City will set a threshold under which projects will not be eligible for incentives.
- All projects are subject to underwriting to determine total incentive package.





City of Cleveland

Residential Scorecard







RESIDENTIAL SCORING SHEET

There are **99** points available for residential projects.

PRIORITY AREA	MAX. POINTS				
Capital Investment	7				
Value-Added Infrastructure Improvements	10				
Transit & Amenity Access	9				
Project Developer an MBE or FBE	8				
Past Performance on MBE/FBE/CSB Goals	0 (potential –5)				
Re-Use of Existing Buildings	3				
Blighted Properties	3				
Improving Lending Ecosystem	2				
Middle and Opportunity Neighborhoods	6				
Utilization of Publicly-Owned Property	5				
Brownfield Remediation	6				
Alignment with Neighborhood Plans	4				
Affordable Housing	10				
Sustainable Design and Construction	8				
Building Performance Management	6				
Multi-Generational Wealth Building	7				
Other Community Benefits	5				





Capital Investment

Capital investment will include the total project costs invested by the applicant to develop the project. This has a direct connection to the value of the property and the long-term potential to generate tax revenue. A maximum of 7 points can be allocated for this category.

Points available: 7 Grading Scale:

- \$1M to \$2M = 1 point
- \$2M to \$5M = 2 points
- \$5M to \$7M = 3 points
- \$7M to \$30M = 4 points
- \$30M to \$50M = 5 points
- \$50M to \$80M = 6 points
- Over \$80M = 7 points







Value-Added Infrastructure

Projects that make investments in public infrastructure that add value to the community are eligible for up to 10 points total. Below are some examples of value-added public infrastructure and associated points. If your project has other infrastructure elements that you believe add value, please share. While most projects have infrastructure requirements, this category awards points for infrastructure elements that go above and beyond required infrastructure. Staff will evaluate and may elect to award partial points for any item.

Points available: 10

Public Amenities:

- Pedestrian scale lighting = 1 point
- Multi-purpose paths or trails on or nearby the property, especially if connected to existing trail system = 4 points
- Street furnishings such as benches, planters, etc. for public use on private property = 2 points
- Pocket park or public playground on private property = 4 points
- Public art on private property = 3 points

Sustainable Infrastructure:

- Green infrastructure projects (e.g. green roof, bioswale, permeable pavement), as defined by Northeast Ohio Regional Sewer District = 4 points
- Implement risk reduction actions from the Urban Land Institute's <u>Developing Resilience Toolkit.</u> Actions must be relevant to the climate risks for the property, based upon consultation with City staff = 2 points
- Implement at least one (1) action to enhance the resilience of the surrounding community to key climate hazards (e.g. publicly accessible cooling center, tree canopy expansion), based on data from <u>Risk Factor</u> = 2 points
- Tree plantings, potentially with silva cells to promote long term root health = 2 points

Other Value-Added Infrastructure:

- Consolidated utility poles/lines in front of property or burying utility lines = 3 points
- Adjacent roadway improvements that are additive to the project = 4 points
- The project uses Cleveland Public Power for its electrical= 2 points







Transit & Amenity Access

This category will award points for projects located near high frequency public transit stops and in concentrations of 15-minute City amenities.

Points in this category will be assigned based on the project site's TOD score. The TOD score is mostly based on proximity to higher frequency transit service, with special attention near fixed infrastructure (rail stations). To a lesser degree, it weighs how many walkable amenities, services, and public assets currently exist within about 15-minute walk. <u>Click here to view a map of TOD scores in the City</u>.

Points available: 9

Grading Scale:

- TOD Score 0-20 = 0 point
- TOD Score 21-30 = 3 points
- TOD Score 31-40 = 6 points
- TOD Score 41+ = 9 points





Project Developer an MBE or FBE

Developers that are at least 20% partner in a project that are a minority business enterprise (MBE) or a female business enterprise (FBE) will receive points for each certification they carry. Where the firm has a majority stake in the project, an additional 2 points will be awarded.

Points available: 8 Grading Scale:

- MBE = 4 points
- FBE = 2 points
- MBE/FBE firm is at least 50% partner in project = 2 points

Past Performance on MBE/FBE/CSB Goals

Has the developer and/or general contractor been assessed a penalty for non-compliance with MBE/FBE/CSB goals in the past 5 years?

Points available: 0 Possible Deduction: -5 Grading Scale:

- Yes = -5 points
- No = 0 points







Blighted Properties

If any part of the property has a C, D, or F grade on the <u>2023 City of Cleveland Citywide Property</u> <u>Survey</u>, the property is considered blighted. If a developer believes the property survey grade does not reflect the condition of the building, please submit documentation, including photographs and/or past code violations, and staff will make a determination as to whether the property is blighted.

Points available: 3 Grading Scale:

- Blight Grade of C, D, or F = 3
- No = 0

Re-Use of Existing Buildings

Projects that utilize previously vacant buildings or propose adaptive re-use will receive points based on how long the building has been vacant.

Points available: 3 Grading Scale:

- Building has been at least 50% vacant for at least 3 years = 3 points
- Building has been at least 50% vacant for less than 3 years = 2 points
- Adaptive re-use of a building that is more than 50% occupied = 1 point





Improving Lending Ecosystem

The City encourages projects to seek financing in creative ways because that improves the overall lending ecosystem in Cleveland. Projects can earn points if either their primary lender is a bank that has an Affidavit of Intent with the City of Cleveland or their primary lender is a bank that comes from outside the region, and therefore diversifies lending in the Cleveland market.

Points available: 2 Grading Scale:

- Lender has an affidavit of intent with the City of Cleveland = 2 points OR
- Lender comes from outside the greater Cleveland region = 2 points
- No = 0 points

¹ Affidavit of Intent required under Codified Ordinance <u>Section 178.05</u> and in the form contained in <u>Section 178.07</u>, affirming its lending and financing opportunities and defined lending program in support of residential and commercial development in Cleveland's neighborhoods.

Middle and Opportunity Neighborhoods

Projects that are located in Middle and Opportunity Neighborhoods, as designated to determine eligibility for Residential Tax Abatement, can earn points based on the <u>market classification</u>.

Points available: 6 Grading Scale:

- Located in a Middle Neighborhood = 3 points
- Located in an Opportunity Neighborhood = 6 points







Brownfield Remediation

Brownfields are sites that, because of existing or perceived environmental contamination, are expensive and complicated to redevelop. Moreover, they are often associated with neighborhood blight and decline, and can represent a threat to public health. Often, brownfield redevelopment projects move forward when developers obtain public funding to offset additional cost to assess and clean up the contamination. Projects located on sites that require environmental remediation can receive up to 6 points.

Points available: 6

Grading Scale:

- Project has spent, or expects to spend at least \$20,000 to perform an ASTM-standard Phase II Environmental Site Assessment or a Voluntary Action Program ("VAP") compliant Phase II Property Assessment = 3 points AND/OR
- Project has gone through, or is committed to go through the VAP and either has prepared a No Further Action letter, or has obtained from the Ohio Environmental Protection Agency a Covenant Not to Sue = 3 points
- No remediation is needed/will be conducted = 0 points

Utilization of Publicly-Owned Property

Projects that utilize property that is currently owned by the City of Cleveland or a public entity (eg: CMSD, RTA) may receive up to 5 points depending upon the total acreage utilized. This category is scored based on the total acreage of assembled publicly-owned parcels for a project.

Note that acquiring City-owned property requires going through the appropriate public process.

Points available: 5 Grading Scale:

- Less than 1 acre = 2 points
- 1.1 2 acres = 3 points
- 2.1 4 acres = 4 points
- 4.1 or more acres = 5 points







Alignment with Neighborhood Plans

Projects that include specific elements in alignment with the policy goals and land use recommendations from the most recent <u>Citywide Plan</u> will be eligible to receive up to 4 points. If applicable, neighborhood or small area plans adopted by the City Planning Commission may be referred to. The applicant must identify in their application specific components of the Citywide and/or neighborhood/small area plan and describe how to project aligns with these components.

Points available: 4 Grading Scale:

- Fits the Citywide and/or neighborhood plan = 2 points
- AND/OR
- Impactful/meets unmet need in neighborhood that has been identified in the Citywide plan or neighborhood plan = 2 points
- Project does not align with Citywide and/or neighborhood plan = 0 points





Affordable Housing

Projects that include affordable housing units will be considered for additional points based on the percentage of total units that are considered affordable and the level of affordability in different <u>neighborhood market classifications</u>. The City will review proposals to determine if units meet minimum requirements for square footage and number of beds/baths. Affordable housing targets will be updated regularly based on any changes to the City's affordable housing policies and goals. Projects seeking points in this category must demonstrate a commitment to affordability with a restrictive covenant or other legal entity for a period of 15 or more years. Projects can earn a maximum of 10 points can be allocated for this category.

Max Points available: 10

Market Neighborhood					Middle Neighborhood						
		% of Units at affordability						% (of Units at	t affordabi	ility
		10% to 25%	26% to 50%	51% to 75%	76% or more			10% to 25%	26% to 50%	51% to 75%	76% or more
% AMI	60% or lower	4	6	8	10		60% or lower	4	6	8	10
	61-80%	3	4	6	8	% AMI	61-80%	4	6	8	10
	81-120%	2	3	4	6		81-120%	2	4	6	8





Affordable Housing

Projects that include affordable housing units will be considered for additional points based on the percentage of total units that are considered affordable and the level of affordability in different <u>neighborhood market</u> <u>classifications</u>. The City will review proposals to determine if units meet minimum requirements for square footage and number of beds/baths. Affordable housing targets will be updated regularly based on any changes to the City's affordable housing policies and goals. Projects seeking points in this category must demonstrate a commitment to affordability with a restrictive covenant or other legal entity for a period of 15 or more years. Projects can earn a maximum of 10 points can be allocated for this category.

Max Points available: 10

Opportunity Neighborhood									
	% of Units at affordability								
		10% to 25%	26% to 50%	51% to 75%	76% or more				
	60% or Iower	2	3	5	6				
% AMI	61-80%	3	5	7	8				
	81-120%	5	7	9	10				







Sustainable Design and Construction

This point category is meant to encourage the incorporation of sustainable technologies at project sites. Projects proposed to meet the following LEED Standards; LEED BD+C (v4 and v4.1) and WELL v2 Crosswalk, LEED BD+C (v4 and v4.1) and WELL v2 Crosswalk, or latest LEED Certification (v5.0 and above) as well as IFLI Zero Carbon Certification, IFLI Zero Energy Certification may receive up to 8 points depending on the certification level achieved. If you are using a different method to measure sustainable design and construction, please let us know and we will evaluate to determine scoring.

Points available: 8 Grading Scale:

- 2 points (Latest version of LEED Gold)
- 4 points (Latest version of LEED LEED Platinum v4 or above)
- 6 points (Latest version of LEED Crosswalks listed above or greater, plus ILFI Zero Carbon Certification)
- 8 points (Crosswalks listed above or greater, plus IFLI Zero Energy Certification) or ANSI/ASHRAE/IES Standard 100 (2024) for existing buildings)





Building Performance Management

This category will award points for projects that actively manage their building's ongoing performance, in order to reduce energy and water consumption. Projects will be eligible to **receive up to six (6) points** for completing the following three (3) actions. City staff will review projects to ensure compliance.

Points available: 6

Grading Scale:

- Register building on Energy Star Portfolio Manager = 2 points
- Join the Cleveland 2030 District and commit to meeting its energy and water reduction goals = 2 points
- Validate your building's energy and water use data with a third party = 2 points





Multi-Generational Wealth Building

Projects that create opportunities for community ownership of property located in the neighborhood, real estate investment trusts, land trusts, and/or opportunities for direct and accessible resident investment in commercial real estate projects. Please provide information about how your project builds wealth, and staff will award up to 7 points.

Points available: 7

Other Community Benefits

Projects may incorporate other community benefits that are not reflected in the scorecard. If you believe your project has additional community benefits, please provide information about them and staff will award up to 5 points.

Points available: 5





City of Cleveland

Mixed-Use Scorecard







MIXED-USE SCORING SHEET

There are **117** points available for mixed-use projects.

PRIORITY AREA	MAX. POINTS
Capital Investment	7
Value-Added Infrastructure Improvements	10
Total Jobs Created	9
Quality Jobs	5
Transit & Amenity Access	9
Project Developer an MBE or FBE	8
Past Performance on MBE/FBE/CSB Goals	0 (potential –5)
Blighted Properties	3
Re-Use of Existing Buildings	3
Improving Lending Ecosystem	2
Middle and Opportunity Neighborhoods	6
Brownfield Remediation	6
Utilization of Publicly-Owned Property	5
Alignment with Neighborhood Plans	4
Commercial Corridors	4
Affordable Housing	10
Sustainable Design and Construction	8
Building Performance Management	6
Multi-Generational Wealth Building	7
Other Community Benefits	5





Capital Investment

Capital investment will include the total project costs invested by the applicant to develop the project. This has a direct connection to the value of the property and the long-term potential to generate tax revenue. A maximum of 7 points can be allocated for this category.

Points available: 7 Grading Scale:

- \$1M to \$2M = 1 point
- \$2M to \$5M = 2 points
- \$5M to \$7M = 3 points
- \$7M to \$30M = 4 points
- \$30M to \$50M = 5 points
- \$50M to \$80M = 6 points
- Over \$80M = 7 points







Value-Added Infrastructure

Projects that make investments in public infrastructure that add value to the community are eligible for up to 10 points total. Below are some examples of value-added public infrastructure and associated points. If your project has other infrastructure elements that you believe add value, please share. While most projects have infrastructure requirements, this category awards points for infrastructure elements that go above and beyond required infrastructure. Staff will evaluate and may elect to award partial points for any item.

Points available: 10

Public Amenities:

- Pedestrian scale lighting = 1 point
- Multi-purpose paths or trails on or nearby the property, especially if connected to existing trail system = 4 points
- Street furnishings such as benches, planters, etc. for public use on private property = 2 points
- Pocket park or public playground on private property = 4 points
- Public art on private property = 3 points

Sustainable Infrastructure:

- Green infrastructure projects (e.g. green roof, bioswale, permeable pavement), as defined by Northeast Ohio Regional Sewer District = 4 points
- Implement risk reduction actions from the Urban Land Institute's <u>Developing Resilience Toolkit.</u> Actions must be relevant to the climate risks for the property, based upon consultation with City staff = 2 points
- Implement at least one (1) action to enhance the resilience of the surrounding community to key climate hazards (e.g. publicly accessible cooling center, tree canopy expansion), based on data from <u>Risk Factor</u> = 2 points
- Tree plantings, potentially with silva cells to promote long term root health = 2 points

Other Value-Added Infrastructure:

- Consolidated utility poles/lines in front of property or burying utility lines = 3 points
- Adjacent roadway improvements that are additive to the project = 4 points
- The project uses Cleveland Public Power for its electrical= 2 points







Total Jobs Created

Total jobs will include the total number of permanent jobs that will be created on-site once the proposed project is completed. This does not include temporary construction jobs. A maximum of 9 points can be allocated for this category.

Points available: 9

Grading Scale:

- 1-5 jobs = 5 points
- 6-20 jobs= 6 points
- 21-40 jobs = 7 points
- 41-60 jobs= 8 points
- 61+ jobs = 9 points

Quality Jobs

Projects will receive 2 points if at least 80% of permanent employees will earn the Median Household Income of \$17.92/hour (\$37,271 annually). Projects will receive 5 points if they pay at least 80% of permanent employees a living wage rate of \$19.66/hour plus benefits. Living wage and benefit standards will be updated regularly based on the City's policies and goals.

Points available: 5 Grading Scale:

- At least 80% of permanent employees earn Median HH income = 2 points
- At least 80% of permanent employees earn living wage = 5 points
- Does not meet criteria = 0 points





Transit & Amenity Access

This category will award points for projects located near high frequency public transit stops and in concentrations of 15-minute City amenities.

Points in this category will be assigned based on the project site's TOD score. The TOD score is mostly based on proximity to higher frequency transit service, with special attention near fixed infrastructure (rail stations). To a lesser degree, it weighs how many walkable amenities, services, and public assets currently exist within about 15-minute walk. <u>Click here to view a map of TOD scores in the City</u>.

Points available: 9

Grading Scale:

- TOD Score 0-20 = 0 point
- TOD Score 21-30 = 3 points
- TOD Score 31-40 = 6 points
- TOD Score 41+ = 9 points





Project Developer an MBE or FBE

Developers that are at least 20% partner in a project that are a minority business enterprise (MBE) or a female business enterprise (FBE) will receive points for each certification they carry. Where the firm has a majority stake in the project, an additional 2 points will be awarded.

Points available: 8 Grading Scale:

- MBE = 4 points
- FBE = 2 points
- MBE/FBE firm is at least 50% partner in project = 2 points

Past Performance on MBE/FBE/CSB Goals

Has the developer and/or general contractor been assessed a penalty for non-compliance with MBE/FBE/CSB goals in the past 5 years?

Points available: 0 Possible Deduction: -5 Grading Scale:

- Yes = -5 points
- No = 0 points







Blighted Properties

If any part of the property has a C, D, or F grade on the <u>2023 City of Cleveland Citywide Property</u> <u>Survey</u>, the property is considered blighted. If a developer believes the property survey grade does not reflect the condition of the building, please submit documentation, including photographs and/or past code violations, and staff will make a determination as to whether the property is blighted.

Points available: 3 Grading Scale:

- Blight Grade of C, D, or F = 3
- No = 0

Re-Use of Existing Buildings

Projects that utilize previously vacant buildings or propose adaptive re-use will receive points based on how long the building has been vacant.

Points available: 3 Grading Scale:

- Building has been at least 50% vacant for at least 3 years = 3 points
- Building has been at least 50% vacant for less than 3 years = 2 points
- Adaptive re-use of a building that is more than 50% occupied = 1 point





Improving Lending Ecosystem

The City encourages projects to seek financing in creative ways because that improves the overall lending ecosystem in Cleveland. Projects can earn points if either their primary lender is a bank that has an Affidavit of Intent with the City of Cleveland or their primary lender is a bank that comes from outside the region, and therefore diversifies lending in the Cleveland market.

Points available: 2 Grading Scale:

- Lender has an affidavit of intent with the City of Cleveland = 2 points OR
- Lender comes from outside the greater Cleveland region = 2 points
- No = 0 points

¹ Affidavit of Intent required under Codified Ordinance <u>Section 178.05</u> and in the form contained in <u>Section 178.07</u>, affirming its lending and financing opportunities and defined lending program in support of residential and commercial development in Cleveland's neighborhoods.

Middle and Opportunity Neighborhoods

Projects that are located in Middle and Opportunity Neighborhoods, as designated to determine eligibility for Residential Tax Abatement, can earn points based on the <u>market classification</u>.

Points available: 6 Grading Scale:

- Located in a Middle Neighborhood = 3 points
- Located in an Opportunity Neighborhood = 6 points







Brownfield Remediation

Brownfields are sites that, because of existing or perceived environmental contamination, are expensive and complicated to redevelop. Moreover, they are often associated with neighborhood blight and decline, and can represent a threat to public health. Often, brownfield redevelopment projects move forward when developers obtain public funding to offset additional cost to assess and clean up the contamination. Projects located on sites that require environmental remediation can receive up to 6 points.

Points available: 6

Grading Scale:

- Project has spent, or expects to spend at least \$20,000 to perform an ASTM-standard Phase II Environmental Site Assessment or a Voluntary Action Program ("VAP") compliant Phase II Property Assessment = 3 points AND/OR
- Project has gone through, or is committed to go through the VAP and either has prepared a No Further Action letter, or has obtained from the Ohio Environmental Protection Agency a Covenant Not to Sue = 3 points
- No remediation is needed/will be conducted = 0 points

Utilization of Publicly-Owned Property

Projects that utilize property that is currently owned by the City of Cleveland or a public entity (eg: CMSD, RTA) may receive up to 5 points depending upon the total acreage utilized. This category is scored based on the total acreage of assembled publicly-owned parcels for a project.

Note that acquiring City-owned property requires going through the appropriate public process.

Points available: 5 Grading Scale:

- Less than 1 acre = 2 points
- 1.1 2 acres = 3 points
- 2.1 4 acres = 4 points
- 4.1 or more acres = 5 points





Alignment with Neighborhood Plans

Projects that include specific elements in alignment with the policy goals and land use recommendations from the most recent <u>Citywide Plan</u> will be eligible to receive up to 4 points. If applicable, neighborhood or small area plans adopted by the City Planning Commission may be referred to. The applicant must identify in their application specific components of the Citywide and/or neighborhood/small area plan and describe how to project aligns with these components.

Points available: 4 Grading Scale:

Fits the Citywide and/or neighborhood plan = 2 points

AND/OR

- Impactful/meets unmet need in neighborhood that has been identified in the Citywide plan or neighborhood plan = 2 points
- Project does not align with Citywide and/or neighborhood plan = 0 points

Commercial Corridors

Projects proposed on commercial corridors will receive 4 points. A map of commercial corridors in the City is coming soon.

Points available: 4 Grading Scale:

- Project proposed on commercial corridor = 4 points
- Project not on commercial corridor = 0 points







Affordable Housing

Projects that include affordable housing units will be considered for additional points based on the percentage of total units that are considered affordable and the level of affordability in different <u>neighborhood market</u> <u>classifications</u>. The City will review proposals to determine if units meet minimum requirements for square footage and number of beds/baths. Affordable housing targets will be updated regularly based on any changes to the City's affordable housing policies and goals. Projects seeking points in this category must demonstrate a commitment to affordability with a restrictive covenant or other legal entity for a period of 15 or more years. Projects can earn a maximum of 10 points can be allocated for this category.

Max Points available: 10

Market Neighborhood						Middle Neighborhood							
		% of Units at affordability							% c	of Units at	affordabi	lity	
		10% to 25%	26% to 50%	51% to 75%	76% or more				10% to 25%	26% to 50%	51% to 75%	76% or more	
% AMI	60% or Iower	4	6	8	10			60% or Iower	4	6	8	10	
	61-80%	3	4	6	8		% AI	% AMI	61-80%	4	6	8	10
	81-120%	2	3	4	6			81-120%	2	4	6	8	





Affordable Housing

Projects that include affordable housing units will be considered for additional points based on the percentage of total units that are considered affordable and the level of affordability in different <u>neighborhood market</u> <u>classifications</u>. The City will review proposals to determine if units meet minimum requirements for square footage and number of beds/baths. Affordable housing targets will be updated regularly based on any changes to the City's affordable housing policies and goals. Projects seeking points in this category must demonstrate a commitment to affordability with a restrictive covenant or other legal entity for a period of 15 or more years. Projects can earn a maximum of 10 points can be allocated for this category.

Max Points available: 10

	Opportunity Neighborhood									
			% (of Units at affordability						
			10% to26% to51% to25%50%75%			76% or more				
% AMI	60% or Iower	2	3	5	6					
	61-80%	3	5	7	8					
	81-120%	5	7	9	10					





Sustainable Design and Construction

This point category is meant to encourage the incorporation of sustainable technologies at project sites. Projects proposed to meet the following LEED Standards; LEED BD+C (v4 and v4.1) and WELL v2 Crosswalk, LEED BD+C (v4 and v4.1) and WELL v2 Crosswalk, or latest LEED Certification (v5.0 and above) as well as IFLI Zero Carbon Certification, IFLI Zero Energy Certification may receive up to 8 points depending on the certification level achieved. If you are using a different method to measure sustainable design and construction, please let us know and we will evaluate to determine scoring.

Points available: 8 Grading Scale:

- 2 points (Latest version of LEED Gold)
- 4 points (Latest version of LEED LEED Platinum v4 or above)
- 6 points (Latest version of LEED Crosswalks listed above or greater, plus ILFI Zero Carbon Certification)
- 8 points (Crosswalks listed above or greater, plus IFLI Zero Energy Certification) or ANSI/ASHRAE/IES Standard 100 (2024) for existing buildings)





Building Performance Management

This category will award points for projects that actively manage their building's ongoing performance, in order to reduce energy and water consumption. Projects will be eligible to **receive up to six (6) points** for completing the following three (3) actions. City staff will review projects to ensure compliance.

Points available: 6

Grading Scale:

- Register building on Energy Star Portfolio Manager 2 points
- Join the Cleveland 2030 District and commit to meeting its energy and water reduction goals – 2 points
- Validate your building's energy and water use data with a third party 2 points





Multi-Generational Wealth Building

Projects that create opportunities for community ownership of property located in the neighborhood, real estate investment trusts, land trusts, and/or opportunities for direct and accessible resident investment in commercial real estate projects. Please provide information about how your project builds wealth, and staff will award up to 7 points.

Points available: 7

Other Community Benefits

Projects may incorporate other community benefits that are not reflected in the scorecard. If you believe your project has additional community benefits, please provide information about them and staff will award up to 5 points.

Points available: 5





City of Cleveland

Commercial and Industrial Scorecard

Projects with 40,000 Square Feet of Development or more







COMMERCIAL AND INDUSTRIAL SCORING SHEET

There are **117** points available for commercial and industrial projects.

PRIORITY AREA	MAX. POINTS
Capital Investment	7
Value-Added Infrastructure Improvements	10
Total Jobs Created	9
Quality Jobs	5
Target Industry	10
Transit & Amenity Access	9
Project Developer an MBE or FBE	8
Past Performance on MBE/FBE/CSB Goals	0 (potential –5)
Blighted Properties	3
Re-use of Existing Buildings	3
Improving Lending Ecosystem	2
Middle and Opportunity Neighborhoods	6
Brownfield Remediation	6
Utilization of Publicly-Owned Property	5
Alignment with Neighborhood Plans	4
Commercial Corridors	4
Sustainable Design and Construction	8
Building Performance Management	6
Multi-Generational Wealth Building	7
Other Community Benefits	5





Capital Investment

Capital investment will include the total project costs invested by the applicant to develop the project. This has a direct connection to the value of the property and the long-term potential to generate tax revenue. A maximum of 7 points can be allocated for this category.

Points available: 7 Grading Scale:

- \$1M to \$2M = 1 point
- \$2M to \$5M = 2 points
- \$5M to \$7M = 3 points
- \$7M to \$30M = 4 points
- \$30M to \$50M = 5 points
- \$50M to \$80M = 6 points
- Over \$80M = 7 points







Value-Added Infrastructure

Projects that make investments in public infrastructure that add value to the community are eligible for up to 10 points total. Below are some examples of value-added public infrastructure and associated points. If your project has other infrastructure elements that you believe add value, please share. While most projects have infrastructure requirements, this category awards points for infrastructure elements that go above and beyond required infrastructure. Staff will evaluate and may elect to award partial points for any item.

Points available: 10

Public Amenities:

- Pedestrian scale lighting = 1 point
- Multi-purpose paths or trails on or nearby the property, especially if connected to existing trail system = 4 points
- Street furnishings such as benches, planters, etc. for public use on private property = 2 points
- Pocket park or public playground on private property = 4 points
- Public art on private property = 3 points

Sustainable Infrastructure:

- Green infrastructure projects (e.g. green roof, bioswale, permeable pavement), as defined by Northeast Ohio Regional Sewer District = 4 points
- Implement risk reduction actions from the Urban Land Institute's <u>Developing Resilience Toolkit.</u> Actions must be relevant to the climate risks for the property, based upon consultation with City staff = 2 points
- Implement at least one (1) action to enhance the resilience of the surrounding community to key climate hazards (e.g. publicly accessible cooling center, tree canopy expansion), based on data from <u>Risk Factor</u> = 2 points
- Tree plantings, potentially with silva cells to promote long term root health = 2 points

Other Value-Added Infrastructure:

- Consolidated utility poles/lines in front of property or burying utility lines = 3 points
- Adjacent roadway improvements that are additive to the project = 4 points
- The project uses Cleveland Public Power for its electrical= 2 points





Total Jobs Created

Total jobs will include the total number of permanent jobs that will be created on-site once the proposed project is completed. This does not include temporary construction jobs. A maximum of 9 points can be allocated for this category.

Points available: 9

Grading Scale:

- 50-100 jobs = 5 points
- 101-500 jobs = 7 points
- 501+ jobs = 9 points

Quality Jobs

Projects will receive 2 points if at least 80% of permanent employees will earn the Median Household Income of \$17.92/hour (\$37,271 annually). Projects will receive 5 points if they pay at least 80% of permanent employees a living wage rate of \$19.66/hour plus benefits. Living wage and benefit standards will be updated regularly based on the City's policies and goals.

Points available: 5 Grading Scale:

- At least 80% of permanent employees earn Median HH income = 2 points
- At least 80% of permanent employees earn living wage = 5 points
- Does not meet criteria = 0 points





Transit & Amenity Access

This category will award points for projects located near high frequency public transit stops and in concentrations of 15-minute City amenities.

Points in this category will be assigned based on the project site's TOD score. The TOD score is mostly based on proximity to higher frequency transit service, with special attention near fixed infrastructure (rail stations). To a lesser degree, it weighs how many walkable amenities, services, and public assets currently exist within about 15-minute walk. <u>Click here to view a map of TOD scores in the City</u>.

Points available: 9

- TOD Score 0-20 = 0 point
- TOD Score 21-30 = 3 points
- TOD Score 31-40 = 6 points
- TOD Score 41+ = 9 points





Project Developer an MBE or FBE

Developers that are at least 20% partner in a project that are a minority business enterprise (MBE) or a female business enterprise (FBE) will receive points for each certification they carry. Where the firm has a majority stake in the project, an additional 2 points will be awarded.

Points available: 8 Grading Scale:

- MBE = 4 points
- FBE = 2 points
- MBE/FBE firm is at least 50% partner in project = 2 points

Past Performance on MBE/FBE/CSB Goals

Has the developer and/or general contractor been assessed a penalty for non-compliance with MBE/FBE/CSB goals in the past 5 years?

Points available: 0 Possible Deduction: -5 Grading Scale:

- Yes = -5 points
- No = 0 points







Target Industry

Businesses that are identified as a target industry may receive 10 points. The target industries include:

- Advanced Manufacturing
- Food and Beverage Manufacturing
- Water Technology
- Health and Biotechnology
- Aerospace and Defense
- Sustainable Energy

Target industry classifications will be updated regularly based on the City's economic goals. Note: this excludes facilities that solely focused on logistics and distribution.

Points available: 10

- Business in a target industry = 10 points
- Business not in target industry = 0 points





Blighted Properties

If any part of the property has a C, D, or F grade on the <u>2023 City of Cleveland Citywide Property</u> <u>Survey</u>, the property is considered blighted. If a developer believes the property survey grade does not reflect the condition of the building, please submit documentation, including photographs and/or past code violations, and staff will make a determination as to whether the property is blighted.

Points available: 3 Grading Scale:

- Blight Grade of C, D, or F = 3
- No = 0

Re-Use of Existing Buildings

Projects that utilize previously vacant buildings or propose adaptive re-use will receive points based on how long the building has been vacant.

Points available: 3 Grading Scale:

- Building has been at least 50% vacant for at least 3 years = 3 points
- Building has been at least 50% vacant for less than 3 years = 2 points
- Adaptive re-use of a building that is more than 50% occupied = 1 point





Improving Lending Ecosystem

The City encourages projects to seek financing in creative ways because that improves the overall lending ecosystem in Cleveland. Projects can earn points if either their primary lender is a bank that has an Affidavit of Intent with the City of Cleveland or their primary lender is a bank that comes from outside the region, and therefore diversifies lending in the Cleveland market.

Points available: 2 Grading Scale:

- Lender has an affidavit of intent with the City of Cleveland = 2 points OR
- Lender comes from outside the greater Cleveland region = 2 points
- No = 0 points

¹ Affidavit of Intent required under Codified Ordinance <u>Section 178.05</u> and in the form contained in <u>Section 178.07</u>, affirming its lending and financing opportunities and defined lending program in support of residential and commercial development in Cleveland's neighborhoods.

Middle and Opportunity Neighborhoods

Projects that are located in Middle and Opportunity Neighborhoods, as designated to determine eligibility for Residential Tax Abatement, can earn points based on the <u>market classification</u>.

Points available: 6 Grading Scale:

- Located in a Middle Neighborhood = 3 points
- Located in an Opportunity Neighborhood = 6 points







Brownfield Remediation

Brownfields are sites that, because of existing or perceived environmental contamination, are expensive and complicated to redevelop. Moreover, they are often associated with neighborhood blight and decline, and can represent a threat to public health. Often, brownfield redevelopment projects move forward when developers obtain public funding to offset additional cost to assess and clean up the contamination. Projects located on sites that require environmental remediation can receive up to 6 points.

Points available: 6

Grading Scale:

- Project has spent, or expects to spend at least \$20,000 to perform an ASTM-standard Phase II Environmental Site Assessment or a Voluntary Action Program ("VAP") compliant Phase II Property Assessment = 3 points
 AND/OR
- Project has gone through, or is committed to go through the VAP and either has prepared a No Further Action letter, or has obtained from the Ohio Environmental Protection Agency a Covenant Not to Sue = 3 points
- No remediation is needed/will be conducted = 0 points

Utilization of Publicly-Owned Property

Projects that utilize property that is currently owned by the City of Cleveland or a public entity (eg: CMSD, RTA) may receive up to 5 points depending upon the total acreage utilized. This category is scored based on the total acreage of assembled publicly-owned parcels for a project.

Note that acquiring City-owned property requires going through the appropriate public process.

Points available: 5 Grading Scale:

- Less than 2 acres = 1 point
- 2-5 acres = 2 points
- 6-8 acres = 3 points
- 8-10 = 4 points
- More than 10 acres = 5 points







Alignment with Neighborhood Plans

Projects that include specific elements in alignment with the policy goals and land use recommendations from the most recent <u>Citywide Plan</u> will be eligible to receive up to 4 points. If applicable, neighborhood or small area plans adopted by the City Planning Commission may be referred to. The applicant must identify in their application specific components of the Citywide and/or neighborhood/small area plan and describe how to project aligns with these components.

Points available: 4 Grading Scale:

Fits the Citywide and/or neighborhood plan = 2 points

AND/OR

- Impactful/meets unmet need in neighborhood that has been identified in the Citywide plan or neighborhood plan = 2 points
- Project does not align with Citywide and/or neighborhood plan = 0 points

Commercial Corridors

Projects proposed on commercial corridors will receive 4 points. A map of commercial corridors in the City is coming soon.

Points available: 4 Grading Scale:

- Project proposed on commercial corridor = 4 points
- Project not on commercial corridor = 0 points







Sustainable Design and Construction

This point category is meant to encourage the incorporation of sustainable technologies at project sites. Projects proposed to meet the following LEED Standards; LEED BD+C (v4 and v4.1) and WELL v2 Crosswalk, LEED BD+C (v4 and v4.1) and WELL v2 Crosswalk, or latest LEED Certification (v5.0 and above) as well as IFLI Zero Carbon Certification, IFLI Zero Energy Certification may receive up to 8 points depending on the certification level achieved. If you are using a different method to measure sustainable design and construction, please let us know and we will evaluate to determine scoring.

Points available: 8

- 2 points (Latest version of LEED Gold)
- 4 points (Latest version of LEED LEED Platinum v4 or above)
- 6 points (Latest version of LEED Crosswalks listed above or greater, plus ILFI Zero Carbon Certification)
- 8 points (Crosswalks listed above or greater, plus IFLI Zero Energy Certification) or ANSI/ASHRAE/IES Standard 100 (2024) for existing buildings)





Building Performance Management

This category will award points for projects that actively manage their building's ongoing performance, in order to reduce energy and water consumption. Projects will be eligible to **receive up to six (6) points** for completing the following three (3) actions. City staff will review projects to ensure compliance.

Points available: 6

- Register building on Energy Star Portfolio Manager 2 points
- Join the Cleveland 2030 District and commit to meeting its energy and water reduction goals – 2 points
- Validate your building's energy and water use data with a third party 2 points





Multi-Generational Wealth Building

Projects that create opportunities for community ownership of property located in the neighborhood, real estate investment trusts, land trusts, and/or opportunities for direct and accessible resident investment in commercial real estate projects. Please provide information about how your project builds wealth, and staff will award up to 7 points.

Points available: 7

Other Community Benefits

Projects may incorporate other community benefits that are not reflected in the scorecard. If you believe your project has additional community benefits, please provide information about them and staff will award up to 5 points.

Points available: 5





City of Cleveland

Commercial: Neighborhood Areas Scorecard

Projects with less than 40,000 Square Feet of Development







COMMERCIAL NEIGHBORHOOD AREA SCORING SHEET

There are **107** points available for commercial neighborhood area projects.

PRIORITY AREA	MAX. POINTS
Capital Investment	7
Value-Added Infrastructure Improvements	10
Total Jobs Created	9
Quality Jobs	5
Transit & Amenity Access	9
Project Developer an MBE or FBE	8
Past Performance on MBE/FBE/CSB Goals	0 (potential –5)
Blighted Properties	3
Re-Use of Existing Buildings	3
Improving Lending Ecosystem	2
Middle and Opportunity Neighborhoods	6
Brownfield Remediation	6
Utilization of Publicly-Owned Property	5
Alignment with Neighborhood Plans	4
Commercial Corridors	4
Affordable Housing	10
Sustainable Design and Construction	8
Building Performance Management	6
Multi-Generational Wealth Building	7
Other Community Benefits	5





Capital Investment

Capital investment will include the total project costs invested by the applicant to develop the project. This has a direct connection to the value of the property and the long-term potential to generate tax revenue. A maximum of 7 points can be allocated for this category.

Points available: 7 Grading Scale:

- \$1M to \$2M = 1 point
- \$2M to \$5M = 2 points
- \$5M to \$7M = 3 points
- \$7M to \$30M = 4 points
- \$30M to \$50M = 5 points
- \$50M to \$80M = 6 points
- Over \$80M = 7 points







Value-Added Infrastructure

Projects that make investments in public infrastructure that add value to the community are eligible for up to 10 points total. Below are some examples of value-added public infrastructure and associated points. If your project has other infrastructure elements that you believe add value, please share. While most projects have infrastructure requirements, this category awards points for infrastructure elements that go above and beyond required infrastructure. Staff will evaluate and may elect to award partial points for any item.

Points available: 10

Public Amenities:

- Pedestrian scale lighting = 1 point
- Multi-purpose paths or trails on or nearby the property, especially if connected to existing trail system = 4 points
- Street furnishings such as benches, planters, etc. for public use on private property = 2 points
- Pocket park or public playground on private property = 4 points
- Public art on private property = 3 points

Sustainable Infrastructure:

- Green infrastructure projects (e.g. green roof, bioswale, permeable pavement), as defined by Northeast Ohio Regional Sewer District = 4 points
- Implement risk reduction actions from the Urban Land Institute's <u>Developing Resilience Toolkit.</u> Actions must be relevant to the climate risks for the property, based upon consultation with City staff = 2 points
- Implement at least one (1) action to enhance the resilience of the surrounding community to key climate hazards (e.g. publicly accessible cooling center, tree canopy expansion), based on data from <u>Risk Factor</u> = 2 points
- Tree plantings, potentially with silva cells to promote long term root health = 2 points

Other Value-Added Infrastructure:

- Consolidated utility poles/lines in front of property or burying utility lines = 3 points
- Adjacent roadway improvements that are additive to the project = 4 points
- The project uses Cleveland Public Power for its electrical= 2 points





Total Jobs Created

Total jobs will include the total number of permanent jobs that will be created on-site once the proposed project is completed. This does not include temporary construction jobs. A maximum of 9 points can be allocated for this category.

Points available: 9

Grading Scale:

- 1-5 jobs = 5 points
- 6-20 jobs= 6 points
- 21-40 jobs = 7 points
- 41-60 jobs= 8 points
- 61+ jobs = 9 points

Quality Jobs

Projects will receive 2 points if at least 80% of permanent employees will earn the Median Household Income of \$17.92/hour (\$37,271 annually). Projects will receive 5 points if they pay at least 80% of permanent employees a living wage rate of \$19.66/hour plus benefits. Living wage and benefit standards will be updated regularly based on the City's policies and goals.

Points available: 5 Grading Scale:

- At least 80% of permanent employees earn Median HH income = 2 points
- At least 80% of permanent employees earn living wage = 5 points
- Does not meet criteria = 0 points





Transit & Amenity Access

This category will award points for projects located near high frequency public transit stops and in concentrations of 15-minute City amenities.

Points in this category will be assigned based on the project site's TOD score. The TOD score is mostly based on proximity to higher frequency transit service, with special attention near fixed infrastructure (rail stations). To a lesser degree, it weighs how many walkable amenities, services, and public assets currently exist within about 15-minute walk. <u>Click here to view a map of TOD scores in the City</u>.

Points available: 9

- TOD Score 0-20 = 0 point
- TOD Score 21-30 = 3 points
- TOD Score 31-40 = 6 points
- TOD Score 41+ = 9 points





Project Developer an MBE or FBE

Developers that are at least 20% partner in a project that are a minority business enterprise (MBE) or a female business enterprise (FBE) will receive points for each certification they carry. Where the firm has a majority stake in the project, an additional 2 points will be awarded.

Points available: 8 Grading Scale:

- MBE = 4 points
- FBE = 2 points
- MBE/FBE firm is at least 50% partner in project = 2 points

Past Performance on MBE/FBE/CSB Goals

Has the developer and/or general contractor been assessed a penalty for non-compliance with MBE/FBE/CSB goals in the past 5 years?

Points available: 0 Possible Deduction: -5 Grading Scale:

- Yes = -5 points
- No = 0 points







Blighted Properties

If any part of the property has a C, D, or F grade on the <u>2023 City of Cleveland Citywide Property</u> <u>Survey</u>, the property is considered blighted. If a developer believes the property survey grade does not reflect the condition of the building, please submit documentation, including photographs and/or past code violations, and staff will make a determination as to whether the property is blighted.

Points available: 3 Grading Scale:

- Blight Grade of C, D, or F = 3
- No = 0

Re-Use of Existing Buildings

Projects that utilize previously vacant buildings or propose adaptive re-use will receive points based on how long the building has been vacant.

Points available: 3 Grading Scale:

- Building has been at least 50% vacant for at least 3 years = 3 points
- Building has been at least 50% vacant for less than 3 years = 2 points
- Adaptive re-use of a building that is more than 50% occupied = 1 point





Improving Lending Ecosystem

The City encourages projects to seek financing in creative ways because that improves the overall lending ecosystem in Cleveland. Projects can earn points if either their primary lender is a bank that has an Affidavit of Intent with the City of Cleveland or their primary lender is a bank that comes from outside the region, and therefore diversifies lending in the Cleveland market.

Points available: 2

Grading Scale:

- Lender has an affidavit of intent with the City of Cleveland = 2 points OR
- Lender comes from outside the greater Cleveland region = 2 points
- No = 0 points

¹ Affidavit of Intent required under Codified Ordinance <u>Section</u> <u>178.05</u> and in the form contained in <u>Section 178.07</u>, affirming its lending and financing opportunities and defined lending program in support of residential and commercial development in Cleveland's neighborhoods.

Middle and Opportunity Neighborhoods

Projects that are located in Middle and Opportunity Neighborhoods, as designated to determine eligibility for Residential Tax Abatement, can earn points based on the <u>market classification</u>.

Points available: 6 Grading Scale:

- Located in a Middle Neighborhood = 3 points
- Located in an Opportunity Neighborhood = 6 points







Brownfield Remediation

Brownfields are sites that, because of existing or perceived environmental contamination, are expensive and complicated to redevelop. Moreover, they are often associated with neighborhood blight and decline, and can represent a threat to public health. Often, brownfield redevelopment projects move forward when developers obtain public funding to offset additional cost to assess and clean up the contamination. Projects located on sites that require environmental remediation can receive up to 6 points.

Points available: 6

Grading Scale:

 Project has spent, or expects to spend at least \$20,000 to perform an ASTM-standard Phase II Environmental Site Assessment or a Voluntary Action Program ("VAP") compliant Phase II Property Assessment = 3 points

AND/OR

- Project has gone through, or is committed to go through the VAP and either has prepared a No Further Action letter, or has obtained from the Ohio Environmental Protection Agency a Covenant Not to Sue = 3 points
- No remediation is needed/will be conducted = 0 points

Utilization of Publicly-Owned Property

Projects that utilize property that is currently owned by the City of Cleveland or a public entity (eg: CMSD, RTA) may receive up to 5 points depending upon the total acreage utilized. This category is scored based on the total acreage of assembled publicly-owned parcels for a project.

Note that acquiring City-owned property requires going through the appropriate public process.

Points available: 5 Grading Scale:

- Less than 1 acre = 2 points
- 1.1 2 acres = 3 points
- 2.1 4 acres = 4 points
- 4.1 or more acres = 5 points







Alignment with Neighborhood Plans

Projects that include specific elements in alignment with the policy goals and land use recommendations from the most recent <u>Citywide Plan</u> will be eligible to receive up to 4 points. If applicable, neighborhood or small area plans adopted by the City Planning Commission may be referred to. The applicant must identify in their application specific components of the Citywide and/or neighborhood/small area plan and describe how to project aligns with these components.

Points available: 4 Grading Scale:

Fits the Citywide and/or neighborhood plan = 2 points

AND/OR

- Impactful/meets unmet need in neighborhood that has been identified in the Citywide plan or neighborhood plan = 2 points
- Project does not align with Citywide and/or neighborhood plan = 0 points

Commercial Corridors

Projects proposed on commercial corridors will receive 4 points. A map of commercial corridors in the City is coming soon.

Points available: 4 Grading Scale:

- Project proposed on commercial corridor = 4 points
- Project not on commercial corridor = 0 points







Sustainable Design and Construction

This point category is meant to encourage the incorporation of sustainable technologies at project sites. Projects proposed to meet the following LEED Standards; LEED BD+C (v4 and v4.1) and WELL v2 Crosswalk, LEED BD+C (v4 and v4.1) and WELL v2 Crosswalk, or latest LEED Certification (v5.0 and above) as well as IFLI Zero Carbon Certification, IFLI Zero Energy Certification may receive up to 8 points depending on the certification level achieved. If you are using a different method to measure sustainable design and construction, please let us know and we will evaluate to determine scoring.

Points available: 8

- 2 points (Latest version of LEED Gold)
- 4 points (Latest version of LEED LEED Platinum v4 or above)
- 6 points (Latest version of LEED Crosswalks listed above or greater, plus ILFI Zero Carbon Certification)
- 8 points (Crosswalks listed above or greater, plus IFLI Zero Energy Certification) or ANSI/ASHRAE/IES Standard 100 (2024) for existing buildings)





Building Performance Management

This category will award points for projects that actively manage their building's ongoing performance, in order to reduce energy and water consumption. Projects will be eligible to **receive up to six (6) points** for completing the following three (3) actions. City staff will review projects to ensure compliance.

Points available: 6

- Register building on Energy Star Portfolio Manager 2 points
- Join the Cleveland 2030 District and commit to meeting its energy and water reduction goals – 2 points
- Validate your building's energy and water use data with a third party 2 points





Multi-Generational Wealth Building

Projects that create opportunities for community ownership of property located in the neighborhood, real estate investment trusts, land trusts, and/or opportunities for direct and accessible resident investment in commercial real estate projects. Please provide information about how your project builds wealth, and staff will award up to 7 points.

Points available: 7

Other Community Benefits

Projects may incorporate other community benefits that are not reflected in the scorecard. If you believe your project has additional community benefits, please provide information about them and staff will award up to 5 points.

Points available: 5



